

Planning Committee

Thursday 18 September, 2008

PRESENT:

Councillor Lock, in the Chair.

Councillor Mrs. Bowyer, Vice-Chair.

Councillors Browne, Mrs. Dolan, M. Foster, Mrs. Foster, Lowry, Mrs. Nicholson (substitute for Councillor Mrs. Stephens), Nicholson, Stevens, Wheeler and Wildy.

Apology for absence: Councillor Mrs. Stephens.

The meeting started at 2.30 p.m. and finished at 5.55 p.m.

41. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

There were no declarations of interest made by Members in accordance with the Code of Conduct.

42. MINUTES

With regard to minute 39, concerns were raised that a number of Members had been unable to attend the site visit due to a clash of Council meetings. It was suggested that, where future changes to the site visit schedule were necessary, the time and date be left for officers to arrange following liaison with Members outside of the meeting.

Resolved that the minutes of the meeting held on 21 August, 2008, be confirmed as a correct record.

(Councillor Wildy's proposal regarding changes to the site visit schedule, having been seconded by Councillor Browne, was put to the vote and declared lost).

43. CHAIR'S URGENT BUSINESS

Neptune Park, Maxwell Road, Cattedown, Plymouth 08/00227/FUL

The Chair referred to the public speaking schedule which indicated that the applicant's agent had requested to speak on the matter again. Members' attention was drawn to the fact that this was contrary to the Committee's published guidance on public speaking. However, it was suggested that as consideration of this application was slightly different to others, permission be granted on this occasion for the following reasons –

- the proposal differed vastly from the previous one
- the Health and Safety Executive's (HSE) response had changed
- representatives from the HSE were in attendance at the Committee's invitation
- the Assistant Director of Development was in attendance at the Committee's invitation

Resolved that the applicant's agent be permitted to speak again on this item.

(In accordance with Section 100(B)(4)(b) of the Local Government Act, 1972, the Chair brought forward the above item for consideration because of the need to consult members and make a decision).

44. QUESTIONS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC

There were no questions from members of the public.

45. **PLANNING APPLICATIONS FOR CONSIDERATION**

The Committee considered the following planning applications, development proposals by local authorities and statutory consultations submitted under the Town and Country Planning Act, 1990, and the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act, 1990.

Addendum reports were circulated in respect of minute numbers 45.3 and 45.4.

45.1 NEPTUNE PARK, MAXWELL ROAD, CATTEDOWN, PLYMOUTH 08/00227/FUL
(Cattedown Regeneration Ltd.)

Decision:

Application **REFUSED**.

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard from the HSE).

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard from the Assistant Director of Development).

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard from the applicant's agent).

(Councillor Wheeler's proposal to be Minded to Grant the application, subject to S106, but Deferred for setting of appropriate conditions, having been seconded by Councillor Wildy, was put to the vote and declared lost).

45.2 OLD CONVENT OF NOTRE DAME, 119 LOOSELEIGH LANE, DERRIFORD,
PLYMOUTH 08/00159/OUT
(Veeda Clinical Research Ltd.)

Decision:

Application **DEFERRED** for a site visit under criteria 1.

(Councillor Browne's proposal, having been seconded by Councillor Wildy, was put to the vote and declared carried).

45.3 DERRIFORD HOSPITAL, DERRIFORD ROAD, DERRIFORD, PLYMOUTH
08/00971/FUL
(Plymouth Hospitals NHS Trust)

Decision:

Application **DEFERRED** for further negotiation, Delegated to Chair, Vice- and Shadow Chair.

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard from the applicant).

(Councillor Wheeler's proposal, having been seconded by Councillor Mrs. Foster, was put to the vote and declared carried).

45.4 ALSTON HOUSE, 2 PLYMBRIDGE ROAD, PLYMPTON, PLYMOUTH
08/00614/FUL
(Alston Homes)

Decision:

Application **DEFERRED** for further negotiations in respect of 30% affordable housing contribution and bat mitigation measures.

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard from the applicant's agent).

(The Chair's proposal, having been seconded by Councillor Wildy, was put to the vote and declared carried).

45.5 SEATON COURT, 2 WILLIAM PRANCE ROAD, PLYMOUTH 08/00097/FUL
(Plymouth Land Registry)

Decision:

Application **GRANTED** conditionally, subject to amendment of wording to Condition 3 to specify "inclusion of the planting of 120 trees".

45.6 DERRIFORD HOSPITAL, DERRIFORD ROAD, PLYMOUTH 08/01258/FUL
(NHS Estates)

Decision:

Application **GRANTED** conditionally.

45.7 EGGBUCKLAND VALE PRIMARY SCHOOL, CHARFIELD DRIVE,
EGGBUCKLAND, PLYMOUTH 08/01318/FUL
(Eggbuckland Vale Primary School)

Decision:

Application **GRANTED** conditionally, subject to an additional Condition 4 for the submission of car parking management proposals prior to commencement of works.

(Councillor Lowry's proposal, having been seconded by Councillor Stevens, was put to the vote and declared carried).

45.8 LIPSON COMMUNITY COLLEGE, BERNICE TERRACE, LIPSON, PLYMOUTH
08/01205/FUL

(Lipson Community College)

Decision:

Application **GRANTED** conditionally.

45.9 DRIFT COTTAGE, BORINGDON ROAD, TURNCHAPEL, PLYMOUTH
08/00744/FUL

(Mrs. Suzanne Wixey)

Decision:

Application **DEFERRED** for site visit under criteria 1.

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard from the applicant).

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard representations against the application).

(Councillor Lowry's proposal, having been seconded by Councillor Stevens was put to the vote and declared carried).

45.10 76 RADFORD PARK ROAD, PLYMSTOCK, PLYMOUTH 08/01451/FUL
(Mrs. Lesley Mainwaring)

Decision:

Application **MINDED** to refuse, Deferred for Advertisement Period and Delegated to Head of Planning.

45.11 56 THE MEAD, PLYMPTON, PLYMOUTH 08/01484/FUL
(Mr. and Mrs. G. John)

Decision:

Application **GRANTED** conditionally.

45.12 3 CONISTON GARDENS, PLYMOUTH 08/01379/FUL
(Mr. Peter Curno)

Decision:

Application **GRANTED** conditionally.

45.13 91 LANGLEY CRESCENT, SOUTHWAY, PLYMOUTH 08/01423/FUL
(Mr. and Mrs. Mellor)

Decision:

Application **GRANTED** conditionally.

45.14 4 MOORCROFT CLOSE, PLYMSTOCK, PLYMOUTH 08/01309/FUL
(Mr. S. Chapman)
Decision:
Application **WITHDRAWN**.

45.15 10 BURLEIGH PARK ROAD, PEVERELL, PLYMOUTH 08/01165/FUL
(Karrie Abbott)
Decision:
Application **REFUSED**.

46. **PLANNING APPLICATION DECISIONS ISSUED**

The Committee received a report of the Assistant Director of Development (Planning and Regeneration) on decisions issued for the period 13 August to 5 September, 2008, including –

- Committee decisions
- Delegated decisions, subject to conditions where so indicated
- Applications withdrawn
- Applications returned as invalid

Resolved that the report be noted.

47. **APPEAL DECISIONS**

The Committee received a schedule of decisions made by the Planning Inspectorate on appeals arising from the decisions of the City Council.

Resolved that –

- (1) the report be noted;
- (2) a report on the City Council's performance in regards to appeal successes and failures be brought to the next meeting.

48. **EXEMPT BUSINESS**

There were no items of exempt business.

VOTING SCHEDULE

PLEASE NOTE

A SCHEDULE OF VOTING RELATING TO THE MEETING IS ATTACHED AS A SUPPLEMENT TO THESE MINUTES.

Minute Annex

PLANNING COMMITTEE

DATE OF MEETING – 18 SEPTEMBER, 2008

SCHEDULE OF VOTING

Minute No.	Voting For	Voting Against	Abstained	Excluded from voting due to Interests Declared	Absent
Minutes (Site Visit Arrangements)	Councillors Browne, Lowry, Nicholson Stevens and Wildy	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Mrs. Dolan, Mrs. Foster, M. Foster Lock and Lock (casting vote)	Councillors Mrs. Nicholson and Wheeler		
6.1 Neptune Park, Maxwell Road, Cattedown, Plymouth 08/00227/FUL Proposed Revised Recommendation (Lost)	Councillors Browne, M. Foster, Lowry, Stevens, Wheeler and Wildy	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Mrs. Dolan, Mrs. Foster, Lock, Mrs. Nicholson, Nicholson and Lock (casting vote)			
Officers' Recommendation (Carried)	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Mrs. Dolan, Mrs. Foster, Lock, Mrs. Nicholson, Nicholson and Lock (casting vote)	Councillors Mrs. Browne, M. Foster, Lowry, Stevens, Wildy and Wheeler			
6.2 Old Convent of Notre Dame, 119 Looseleigh Lane, Derriford, Plymouth 08/00159/OUT Revised Recommendation	Councillors Browne, Mrs. Dolan, M. Foster, Mrs. Foster, Lowry, Mrs. Nicholson, Nicholson, Stevens, Wheeler and Wildy	Councillor Mrs. Bowyer	Councillor Lock		
6.3 Derriford Hospital, Derriford Road, Plymouth 08/00971/FUL Revised Recommendation	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Browne, Mrs. Dolan, M. Foster, Mrs. Foster, Lock, Lowry, Mrs. Nicholson, Stevens, Wheeler and Wildy				Councillor Nicholson
6.4 Alston House, 2 Plymbridge Road, Plympton, Plymouth 08/00614/FUL Revised Recommendation	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Browne, Mrs. Dolan, M. Foster, Mrs. Foster, Lock, Lowry, Mrs. Nicholson, Stevens, Wheeler and Wildy				Councillor Nicholson

Minute No.	Voting For	Voting Against	Abstained	Excluded from voting due to Interests Declared	Absent
6.5 Seaton Court, 2 William Prance Road, Plymouth 08/00097/FUL	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Browne, Mrs. Dolan, M. Foster, Mrs. Foster, Lock, Lowry, Mrs. Nicholson, Stevens and Wheeler				Councillors Nicholson and Wildy
6.6 Derriford Hospital, Derriford Road, Plymouth 08/01258/FUL	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Browne, Mrs. Dolan, M. Foster, Mrs. Foster, Lock, Lowry, Mrs. Nicholson, Stevens and Wheeler				Councillors Nicholson and Wildy
6.7 Eggbuckland Vale Primary School, Charfield Drive, Eggbuckland, Plymouth 08/01318/FUL Revised Recommendation	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Browne, Mrs. Dolan, M. Foster, Mrs. Foster, Lock, Lowry, Mrs. Nicholson, Stevens and Wheeler				Councillors Nicholson and Wildy
6.8 Lipson Community College, Bernice Terrace, Lipson, Plymouth 08/01205/FUL	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Browne, Mrs. Dolan, M. Foster, Mrs. Foster, Lock, Lowry, Mrs. Nicholson, Stevens and Wheeler				Councillors Nicholson and Wildy
6.9 Drift Cottage, Boringdon Road, Turnchapel, Plymouth 08/00744/FUL Revised Recommendation	Councillors Browne, Mrs. Dolan, M. Foster, Lock, Lowry, Stevens, Wheeler and Wildy	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer and Mrs. Foster			Councillors Mrs. Nicholson and Nicholson
6.10 76 Radford Park Road, Plymstock, Plymouth 08/01451/FUL	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Browne, Mrs. Dolan, M. Foster, Mrs. Foster, Lock, Lowry, Mrs. Nicholson, Stevens, Wheeler and Wildy				Councillor Nicholson
6.11 56 The Mead, Plympton, Plymouth 08/01484/FUL	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Browne, Mrs. Dolan, M. Foster, Mrs. Foster, Lock,				Councillor Nicholson

Minute No.	Voting For	Voting Against	Abstained	Excluded from voting due to Interests Declared	Absent
	Lowry, Mrs. Nicholson, Stevens, Wheeler and Wildy				
6.12 3 Coniston Gardens, Plymouth 08/01379/FUL	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Browne, Mrs. Dolan, M. Foster, Mrs. Foster, Lock, Lowry, Mrs. Nicholson, Stevens, Wheeler and Wildy				Councillor Nicholson
6.13 91 Langley Crescent, Southway, Plymouth 08/01423/FUL	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Browne, Mrs. Dolan, M. Foster, Mrs. Foster, Lock, Lowry, Mrs. Nicholson, Stevens, Wheeler and Wildy				Councillor Nicholson
6.14 4 Moorcroft Close, Plymstock, Plymouth 08/01309/FUL Application Withdrawn					
6.15 10 Burleigh Park Road, Peverell, Plymouth 08/01165/FUL	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Browne, Mrs. Dolan, M. Foster, Mrs. Foster, Lock, Lowry, Mrs. Nicholson, Stevens, Wheeler and Wildy				Councillor Nicholson